UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

ENERGY & ENVIRONMENT LEGAL INSTITUTE)
722 12th St., NW, 4th Floor)
Washington, D.C. 20005)
)
Plaintiff,)
v.) Civil Action No. 16- 1928
UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL)
PROTECTION AGENCY)
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW)
Washington, DC 20460)
)
Defendant.)

COMPLAINT FOR DECLARATORY AND INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

Plaintiff ENERGY & ENVIRONMENT LEGAL INSTITUTE ("E&E Legal") for its complaint against Defendant UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY ("the Agency" or "EPA"), alleges as follows:

- 1. This is an action under the Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA"), 5 U.S.C. § 552, to compel production of records in response to a FOIA request to which EPA has not sent the required response in accordance with *Citizens for Responsibility & Ethics in Washington v. FEC*, 711 F.3d 180 (D.C. Cir. 2013).
- 3. Plaintiff requested a fee waiver as provided by FOIA, due to the public interest in the information the records address, and the media status of the requester.

- 4. EPA has acknowledged receipt of plaintiff's request and granted the request for a fee waiver, saying a search would be conducted in the future.
- 5. EPA has not estimated the volume of responsive records, or the FOIA exemptions which might apply to such records, or the timeframe during which plaintiff could expect a response.
- 6. EPA therefore has not properly responded to plaintiff's request.
- Accordingly, plaintiff files this lawsuit to compel the EPA to comply with the law and produce the properly described public records in this FOIA request.

PARTIES

- 8. Plaintiff Energy & Environment Legal Institute ("E&E Legal") is a nonprofit research, public policy and public interest litigation center incorporated in Virginia, with offices in Washington, DC. E&E Legal is dedicated to advancing responsible regulation and, in particular, economically sustainable environmental and energy policy. E&E Legal's programs include analysis, publication, and a transparency initiative seeking public records relating to environmental and energy policy and how policymakers use public resources.
- Defendant EPA is a federal agency headquartered in Washington, DC whose stated mission is to "protect human health and the environment."

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

10. This Court has jurisdiction pursuant to 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(B), because this brought in the District of Columbia, and because plaintiff and the defendant both maintain offices

- in the District. Furthermore, jurisdiction is proper under 28 U.S.C. § 1331, because the resolution of disputes under FOIA presents a federal question.
- 11. Venue in this court is proper under 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(B) and 28 U.S.C. § 1391(e) because FOIA grants the District Court of the District of Columbia jurisdiction, and because defendant is a federal agency.

FACTUAL BACKGROUND

- 12. On May 18, 2016 plaintiff submitted a FOIA request seeking public records discussing and analyzing the work of the Ramazzini Institute, an organization in Italy that U.S. federal agencies have used to provide them numerous assessments and whose output has become the subject of controversy in recent years. The requested records specifically related to the Institute's analytical and toxicological methods and whether the Institute's studies were being considered for use by the EPA.
- 13. Defendant acknowledged the May 18 request by email on June 1, 2016, assigning it tracking number EPA-HQ-2016-006816.
- 14. Defendant, by the same June 1, 2016 email, requested that plaintiff narrow the scope of the FOIA request, as defendant claimed that the effort required to comply with the request would limit the agency's responsiveness.
- 15. On June 3, 2016 via a phone conversation between plaintiff and Larry Gottesman, Chief FOIA and Privacy Brach of the Office of Environmental Information, plaintiff agreed to narrow the request at issue here to only include EPA's Office of Research and Development, Office of Air and Radiation, and Office of Chemical Safety and Pollution

- Prevention's Office of Science Coordination; further, plaintiff agreed to limit the request to documents discussing the quality and credibility of the Ramazzini Institute's work.
- 16. In June 9, 2016, Mr. Gottesman emailed plaintiff to memorialize this narrowing and to inform plaintiff that the search would begin based on the parameters as narrowed.
- 17. On June 10, 2016 defendant informed plaintiff by letter that the request for the fee waiver had been granted.
- 18. In the intervening months plaintiff has received no other communication from defendant regarding this request, and no indication defendant is in fact processing the request, as required.

Defendant's Reply and Subsequent Proceedings

- 19. Defendant owed substantive responses to plaintiff within 20 working days from the request, which it has failed to provide, in violation of the statutory time limit.
- 20. In memorializing plaintiff's agreed narrowing of the request on June 9, 2016, defendant indicated that the search for and review of responsive records would begin by June 12, 2016. EPA has not contacted plaintiff regarding this request since that date. EPA has taken no extension of time as permitted under certain circumstances by FOIA; EPA provided no records responsive to this request, a production schedule by which plaintiff should expect records or asserted what FOIA exemptions it believe it might apply to potentially responsive records, or otherwise comply with FOIA's requirements within that 20-day timeframe. *Citizens for Responsibility & Ethics in Washington v. FEC*, 711 F.3d 180 (D.C. Cir. 2013).

21. Plaintiff has constructively and actually exhausted the administrative process as regards this request, both because of EPA's failure to abide by FOIA's statutory deadlines, and because EPA has not properly advised plaintiff of the finality of its decisions or any relevant appellate rights.

ARGUMENTS

- 22. Transparency in government is the subject of high-profile promises from the president and attorney general of the United States arguing forcefully against agencies failing to live up to their legal record-keeping and disclosure obligations.
- 23. Under the Freedom of Information Act, after an individual submits a request, an agency must determine within 20 working days after the receipt of any such request whether to comply with such request. 5 U.S.C.S. § 552(a)(6)(A)(i). Under *Citizens for Responsible Ethics in Washington v. Federal Election Commission*, 711 F.3d 180, 186 (D.C. Cir. 2013), that response must provide particularized assurance of the scope of potentially responsive records, including the scope of the records it plans to produce and the scope of documents that it plans to withhold under any FOIA exemptions. This 20-working-day time limit also applies to any appeal. § 552(a) (6)(A)(ii).
- 24. U.S. Code 5 U.S.C.S. § 552(a)(6)(A) proclaims that the 20-day time limit shall not be tolled by the agency except in two narrow scenarios: The agency may make one request to the requester for information and toll the 20-day period while it is awaiting such information that it has reasonably requested from the requester, § 552(a)(6)(A)(ii)(I), and agencies may also toll the statutory time limit if necessary to clarify with the requester issues regarding fee assessment. § 552(a)(6)(A)(ii)(II). In either case, the

- agency's receipt of the requester's response to the agency's request for information or clarification ends the tolling period. EPA did not seek additional information from plaintiff regarding the request at issue in this suit.
- 25. In *Bensman v. National Park Service*, 806 F. Supp. 2d 31 (D.D.C. 2011) this Court noted: "[The effect of] the 2007 Amendments was to impose consequences on agencies that do not act in good faith or otherwise fail to comport with FOIA's requirements. See S. Rep. No. 110-59. To underscore Congress's belief in the importance of the statutory time limit, the 2007 Amendments declare that '[a]n agency shall not assess search fees... if the agency fails to comply with any time limit' of FOIA' (emphasis added).
- 26. Defendant EPA owes plaintiff records responsive to the request at issue in this suit, which request, particularly having been narrowed at defendants request, reasonably described the information sought and were otherwise filed in compliance with applicable law, subject to legitimate withholdings, and has failed to provide responsive records or any substantive response in violation of statutory deadlines.
- 27. Further, should the EPA cross-complain or otherwise argue that its failure to perform is because it is due fees, plaintiff notes that defendant has waived fees and/or waived its ability to assess fees under § 552(a)(4)(A)(viii) by failing to substantively respond to plaintiff within the statutory deadline(s), or by its affirmative waiver in the June 10, 2016 correspondence regarding the request. The EPA, therefore, has waived all fees and must produce the requested documents as required by law.

FIRST CLAIM FOR RELIEF
Seeking Declaratory Judgment

- 28. Plaintiff re-alleges paragraphs 1-27 as if fully set out herein.
- 29. Plaintiff has sought and been denied production of responsive records reflecting the conduct of official business, because defendant has failed to substantively respond pursuant to *Citizens for Responsibility & Ethics in Washington v. FEC*, 711 F.3d 180 (D.C. Cir. 2013).
- 30. Plaintiff asks this Court to enter a judgment declaring that:
 - a. The EPA's correspondence as specifically described in plaintiff's FOIA request described, *supra*, is subject to release under FOIA;
 - b. The EPA must release those requested records or segregable portions thereof subject to legitimate exemptions;
 - c. The EPA may not assess or seek costs and fees for the request at issue in this case, as plaintiff has been granted and continues to be entitled to a waiver of its fees.

SECOND CLAIM FOR RELIEF Seeking Injunctive Relief

- 31. Plaintiff re-alleges paragraphs 1-30 as if fully set out herein.
- 32. Plaintiff is entitled to injunctive relief compelling defendant to produce all records in its possession responsive to plaintiff's FOIA request, without fees, subject to legitimate withholdings.
- 33. Plaintiff asks the Court to order the defendant to produce to plaintiff, within 20 business days of the date of the order, the requested records described in plaintiff's FOIA request, subject to legitimate withholdings.

34. Plaintiff asks the Court to order the Parties to consult regarding withheld documents and to file a status report to the Court within 30 days after plaintiff receives the last of the produced documents, addressing defendant's preparation of a *Vaughn* log and a briefing schedule for resolution of remaining issues associated with plaintiff's challenges to defendant's withholdings and any other remaining issues.

THIRD CLAIM FOR RELIEF

Seeking Costs and Fees

- 35. Plaintiff re-alleges paragraphs 1-34 as if fully set out herein.
- 36. Pursuant to 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(E), the Court may assess against the United States reasonable attorney fees and other litigation costs reasonably incurred in any case under this section in which the complainant has substantially prevailed.
- 37. Plaintiff is statutorily entitled to recover fees and costs incurred as a result of defendant's refusal to fulfill the FOIA request at issue in this case.
- 38. Plaintiff asks the Court to order the defendant to pay reasonable attorney fees and other litigation costs reasonably incurred in this case.

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff requests the declaratory and injunctive relief herein sought, and an award for its attorney fees and costs and such other and further relief as the Court shall deem proper.

Respectfully submitted this 29th day of September, 2016,

_____/s/____Chaim Mandelbaum,
D.D.C. Bar No. VA86199
726 N. Nelson St, Suite 9

8

Arlington, VA 22203 703-577-9973 chaim12@gmail.com

Counsel for Plaintiff

JS-44

(Rev.1/05 DC)												
	I (a) PLAINTIFFS					DEFENDA							,
	ENERGY & ENVIRO	ONMENT LEGA	L INSTITUTE		; E	ENVIRON	ME	NTA	L PR	OTE	CTION AGENCY		1 1
l				DC	COUNTY OF RESIDENCE OF FIRST LISTED DEFENDANT AN U.S. PLAINTIEF CASES ONLY) DC								
	(b) COUNTY OF RESIDENC (EXCEPT IN U.S	CE OF FIRST LISTED PI S. PLAINTIFF CASES)		DC		IOTE: IN LAN AND INVOLV					IFF CASES ONLY) ES, USE THE LOCATION	***************************************	ACT OF
	© ATTORNEYS (FIRM N Chaim Mandelba 726 N. Nelson St Arlington VA, 222 703-577-9973	um , suite 9	TELEPHONE NUMBEI	R)	A A	TTORNEYS (IF K1	NOWN	T)				
ľ	II. BASIS OF JURI										TIES (PLACE AN x IN) FOR DIVERSITY C		
l	_					PTF		DFT				PTF	DFT
	1 U.S. Governmen Plaintiff	_	Question vernment Not a Party)	Citize	en of this Stat	_	1	0			orated or Principal Place ness in This State	O 4	O 4
	2 U.S. Government Defendant	(Indicate	, e Citizenship of n item III)		en of Another	_	2	0	(orated and Principal Plac ness in Another State	ce 🔘 5	O 5
			,		en or Subject gn Country	of a U	3	0		Foreig	n Nation	O 6	O 6
L	(Place a X in		. CASE ASSI N, that best repr								responding Natur	e of Suit)	
	O A. Antitrust	O B. Perso	nal Injury/		\circ C $_{4}$	dministr	atis	op A	gencs	,	O D. Tempora	rv Rosti	าสาราชา
	S A. Animusi	Malpra		ľ		view		е Д	gency		Order/Pr Injunctio	elimina	_
	410 Antitrust	320 Assault, I 330 Federal E 340 Marine 345 Marine P 350 Motor Ve 355 Motor Ve 360 Other Per 362 Medical N 365 Product I	hicle Product Liabili rsonal Injury Malpractice	houd	Social Secur 861 H 862 B 863 D 864 SS 865 R Other Statt 891 A; 892 E; 893 E; 894 E; 890 O	IA ((1395ff) lack Lung (9 IWC/DIWW SID Title XV SI (405(g)	I (40) I cts bilize I Mattion Ty A	ation A atters Act ctions	s (If	ved)	Any nature of suit fro be selected for this ca assignment. *(If Antitrust, then A	m any cate tegory of ca	
	O E. General	Civil (Other)	OR	*******************************	0	F. Pro	Se	Gen	eral (Civil		annoconario con con con con con con con con con co	annous annous annous annous anno
	Real Property 210 Land Condemna 220 Foreclosure 230 Rent, Lease & Ej 240 Torts to Land 245 Tort Product Lia 290 All Other Real Property 370 Other Fraud 371 Truth in Lending 380 Other Personal Property Damage	ectment bility roperty g	Bankruptcy 422 Appeal 28 423 Withdraw Prisoner Petitions 535 Death Per 540 Mandamu 550 Civil Righ 555 Prison Co Property Rights 820 Copyright 830 Patent 840 Trademan Federal Tax Suits 646 Roman 871 IRS-Third USC 7609	al 28 U nalty us & On nts ondition ts rk plainti	SC 157 ther	625 I 630 I 640 I 650 A 660 C 690 C Other Sta 400 S 430 I	Agridothe Drug of Pr Liqu ARR & Airli Docu Safet Othe tute 3ank Com Rate	cultur r Food g Relat opert or Lat & True ne Re pation y/Hear Reap ss & B merce s/etc.	d &Dru ted Seize y 21 USe ws ck gs nal alth portions Banking	ure C 881	480 Consume 490 Cable/Sat 810 Selective 850 Securities Exchang 875 Customer 3410 900 Appeal of under eq 950 Constitut Statutes 890 Other Sta	Organization r Credit ellite TV Service /Commodit r Challenge fee determinal access to tonality of State tutory Actinistrative a	ties/ 12 USC ination o Justice State ons (if

© G. Habeas Co 2255 ☐ 530 Habeas Corpus ☐ 510 Motion/Vacate	Discrimination -General 442 Civil Rights-Employment	I. FOIA/PRIVACY ACT 895 Freedom of Information Act 890 Other Statutory Actions (if Privacy Act) *(If pro se, select this deck)*	J. Student Loan 152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans (excluding veterans)
K. Labor/ER (non-emple) 710 Fair Labor Stat 720 Labor/Mgmt. R 730 Labor/Mgmt. R Disclosure Act 740 Labor Railway 790 Other Labor Li 791 Empl. Ret. Inc.	ISA Oyment) L. Other Civil Right (non-employment) dards Act delations deporting & 441 Voting (if not Voting Right Act) 443 Housing/Accommodation 444 Welfare Act 440 Other Civil Rights tigation 445 American w/Disabilities-	Ints M. Contract 110 Insurance 120 Marine 130 Miller Act 140 Negotiable Instrument 150 Recovery of Overpayment & Enforcement of Judgment 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits 160 Stockholder's Suits	
Proceeding VI. CAUSE OF ACT	_	eopened another district l (specify)	Multi district
VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT VIII. RELATED CAS IF ANY	ACTION UNDER F.R.C.P. 23		Check YES only if demanded in complaint YES NO Complete related case form.
DATE 9/29/2016	SIGNATURE OF ATTORNEY OF REC	CORD Chaim Masshefbaeum	
The JS-44 civil co		ETING CIVIL COVER SHEET JS-44 r Civil Cover Sheet	nleadings or other papers as required by
law, except as provided by loc Court for the purpose of initia	cal rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Cotting the civil docket sheet. Consequently a civil cover slands. These tips coincide with the Roman Numerals on	onference of the United States in September 1974, heet is submitted to the Clerk of Court for each civil	, is required for the use of the Clerk of
	TTY OF RESIDENCE OF FIRST LISTED PLAINTIFF/Agton, D.C.; 88888 if plaintiff is resident of the United St		
III. CITIZI II.	ENSHIP OF PRINCIPAL PARTIES: This section is com	apleted only if diversity of citizenship was selected	l as the Basis of Jurisdiction under Section
primary	ASSIGNMENT AND NATURE OF SUIT: The assignment cause of action found in your complaint. You may selegory of case.		

Because of the need for accurate and complete information, you should ensure the accuracy of the information provided prior to signing the form.

CAUSE OF ACTION: Cite the US Civil Statute under which you are filing and write a brief statement of the primary cause.

RELATED CASES, IF ANY: If you indicated that there is a related case, you must complete a related case form, which may be obtained from the Clerk's

VI.

VIII.

Office.

FOIA Summons 1/13

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

CLEAR FORM

Plaintiff)	
V.)	Civil Action No. 16-1928
Environmental Protection Age	ency)	
Defendant)	
	SUMMON	S IN A CI	VIL ACTION
To: (Defendant's name and addre	U.S. Attorney G Loretta Lynch 950 Pennsylva Washington, De	nia Ave., N	<i>W</i> , Room 511
A lawsuit has been filed	against you.		
serve on the plaintiff an answer to Civil Procedure. The answer or address are:	to the attached con motion must be s ENVIRONMENT LE lelbaum on St, suite 9	mplaint or erved on t	(not counting the day you received it) you must a motion under Rule 12 of the Federal Rules of ne plaintiff or plaintiff's attorney, whose name and ITUTE
If you fail to respond, juc complaint. You also must file yo	•		ntered against you for the relief demanded in the he court.
			ANGELA D. CAESAR, CLERK OF COURT
Date: 9/29/2016			
			Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

FOIA Summons (12/11) (Page 2)

Civil Action No. 16-1928

PROOF OF SERVICE

(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 4 (1))

was ree	This summons for (received by me on (date)	name of individual and title,	if any)			
	☐ I personally serve	ed the summons on the	individual at (place)			
				on (date)	; or	
	☐ I left the summon	ns at the individual's res	sidence or usual pla	ce of abode with (name)		
			, a person of suitab	le age and discretion who resi	des there,	
	on (date)	, and mailed	l a copy to the indiv	vidual's last known address; or	.	
	☐ I served the sum	mons on (name of individue	al)			, who is
	designated by law to	o accept service of proc	ess on behalf of (na	me of organization)		
				on (date)	; or	
	☐ I returned the sur	mmons unexecuted beca	ause			; or
	☐ Other (specify):					
	My fees are \$	for travel ar	nd \$	for services, for a total of \$	0.0	0 .
	I declare under pena	alty of perjury that this i	nformation is true.			
Date:				Server's signature		
				Printed name and title		
				Server's address		

Additional information regarding attempted service, etc:

Print Save As... Reset

FOIA Summons 1/13

UNITED	STATES	DISTRICT	COURT
FOR TH	E DISTRI	ICT OF COI	LUMRIA

CLEAR FORM

ENE	RGY & ENVIRONMENT LEGA Plaintiff)	
	v.)	Civil Action No. 16-1928
	Environmental Protection	Agency)	
	Defenda	nt)	
		SUMMO	NS IN A CI	VIL ACTION
То:	(Defendant's name and ad	Civil Process U.S. Attorne	y for the Distr et, NW 4th Fl	ict of Columbia oor
	A lawsuit has been fil	ed against you.		
	on the plaintiff an answer or the answer are: ENERGY Chaim M 726 N. No	er to the attached	complaint or e served on t	(not counting the day you received it) you must a motion under Rule 12 of the Federal Rules of the plaintiff or plaintiff's attorney, whose name and TITUTE
compl	If you fail to respond, aint. You also must fil		•	ntered against you for the relief demanded in the he court.
				ANGELA D. CAESAR, CLERK OF COURT
Date:	9/29/2016			
	***************************************			Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

FOIA Summons (12/11) (Page 2)

Civil Action No. 16-1928

PROOF OF SERVICE

(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 4 (1))

was ree	This summons for (received by me on (date)	name of individual and title,	if any)			
	☐ I personally serve	ed the summons on the	individual at (place)			
				on (date)	; or	
	☐ I left the summon	ns at the individual's res	sidence or usual pla	ce of abode with (name)		
			, a person of suitab	le age and discretion who resi	des there,	
	on (date)	, and mailed	l a copy to the indiv	vidual's last known address; or	.	
	☐ I served the sum	mons on (name of individue	al)			, who is
	designated by law to	o accept service of proc	ess on behalf of (na	me of organization)		
				on (date)	; or	
	☐ I returned the sur	mmons unexecuted beca	ause			; or
	☐ Other (specify):					
	My fees are \$	for travel ar	nd \$	for services, for a total of \$	0.0	0 .
	I declare under pena	alty of perjury that this i	nformation is true.			
Date:				Server's signature		
				Printed name and title		
				Server's address		

Additional information regarding attempted service, etc:

Print Save As...

Reset

FOIA Summons 1/13

UNITED	STATES	DISTRICT	COURT
FOR TH	E DISTRI	ICT OF COI	LUMRIA

CLEAR FORM

		Plaintiff)	
	v.)	Civil Action No. 16-1928
	Environmen	tal Protection Agend	ey)	
		Defendant)	
			SUMMO	NS IN A C	CIVIL ACTION
To:	(Defendant's n	ame and address)	Environmenta Office of the 1200 Pennsy Washington,	General Cοι Ivania Aven	unsel
	A lawsuit ha	s been filed ag	ainst you.		
		•		•	ou (not counting the day you received it) you must
Civil F	Procedure. Th			*	or a motion under Rule 12 of the Federal Rules of the plaintiff or plaintiff's attorney, whose name and
addres	s are:	ENERGY & EN Chaim Mandel 726 N. Nelson Arlington VA 23	baum St, suite 9	LEGAL INS	STITUTE
compl	•	respond, judg o must file you	•	•	entered against you for the relief demanded in the the court.
					ANGELA D. CAESAR, CLERK OF COURT
Date:	9/29/201	6			
					Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

FOIA Summons (12/11) (Page 2)

Civil Action No. 16-1928

PROOF OF SERVICE

(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 4 (1))

☐ I personally served	the summons on the individual a	t (place)	
		on (date)	; or
☐ I left the summons	at the individual's residence or us	sual place of abode with (name)	
	, a person o	f suitable age and discretion who resid	des there,
on (date)	, and mailed a copy to the	he individual's last known address; or	
☐ I served the summo	ons on (name of individual)		, who
designated by law to a	accept service of process on behal	f of (name of organization)	
		on (date)	; or
☐ I returned the sumr	nons unexecuted because		_ ; c
- 0.1			
☐ Other (specify):			
My fees are \$	for travel and \$	for services, for a total of \$	0.00
T 11 1 1.	Consider Antonio Commentino	·	
I declare under penalty	y of perjury that this information	is true.	
		Server's signature	
		Server s signature	
		Printed name and title	
		Printed name and title	
		Printed name and title	
		Printed name and title	

Additional information regarding attempted service, etc:

Print Save As...

Reset